YOU'LL WISH IT WAS ALL OVER: THE BIBLIOGRAPHIC CONTROL OF GREY LITERATURE WITH REFERENCE TO PRINT FOOTBALL FANZINES

Hazel Hall and Neil Smith

Paper presented at the UK Serials Group 20th Annual Conference, Heriot-Watt University, April 1997

Match report:
This paper examines the history of the fanzine; considers its status as an item of grey literature and discusses the problems encountered by amateur fanzine collectors, experts and librarians in tracing and managing titles. Case study material based on a piece of qualitative research carried out in the Lothians illustrates the difficulties in bibliographic control with particular reference to the football fanzine.

Kick-off: introduction
Hornby (1992) states that the “way the game [football] is consumed seems to offer all sorts of information about our society and culture.” Since the mid-1980s self-published football fanzines have become an element of this consumption of the game and may be used as research material. However, this assumes that they are accessible: as informal publications fanzines can be difficult to trace.

The home team: fanzine history, publishing channels and use
Little formal research has been devoted to fanzine publications. Most of the work completed discusses fanzines in the context of the sociology of sport or sub-cultures.

The adoption of the term "fanzine"
The use of the term “fanzine” can be traced back to 1949 in the United States, when it referred specifically to magazine publications for science fiction fans. Three decades later, and on the opposite side of the Atlantic, the term was re-invented extending the subject area coverage to include soccer and music, and acknowledging authorship by the fans as well as for the fans (Shaw, 1989).

Fanzines as the alternative press
Considering music publishing in particular, Cross (1981) has identified fanzine writing as a “form of journalism that has grown to act as an alternative to the main organs of communication ... [Fanzines] have come into being to fill a gap created by the shortcomings and limitations of established papers”. The alternative press can voice opinion and mobilise readership. For
example, Haynes (1995) describes the part that The Proclaimer played in the “Hands off Hibs” campaign, which fought off the threat of the 1990 £6.1m take-over bid of Hibernian by Wallace Mercer, the chairman of rival Edinburgh team Hearts. Cross (1981) lists the main features of music fanzines as characterised by variable formats; limited circulation and few and informal distribution channels. This is also the case with regards to the alternative press for football (Barnes, 1991).

**Fanzine production and distribution processes**

In the 1970s fanzine publishing was a low-tech process making use of whatever facilities were at hand from carbon paper to flatbed duplicators (Roberts, 1978). Recent developments in technology and increased accessibility to such facilities allow authors to produce their copy using personal computers and desk top publishing software (Haynes, 1995). Football fanzines are sold through specialist shops, by mail order and at some football matches (Shaw, 1989 and Haynes, 1995). It is estimated that there are about 1000 football fanzine in the UK (Haynes, 1995) and most sell between 200-2000 copies (Lacey, 1989). Fanzines can also appear in formats other than print. For example Moores (1981-2) produced an audio fanzine on music and in the past eighteen months web sites devoted to football teams have been established.

**Fanzines as formal information sources**

Few writers address the issue of the fanzinerepresenting a formal information source. Of those who have done so the comments only hint at the likely possible use and acceptance of fanzines as such. That academics are interested in them may be seen as a sign of acceptance: “fanzine culture... may well be studied in decades to come as an important part of late 20th century history” (Hill at the 10th British Society of Sports History Conference quoted by Wood, 1992). Fanzines can be used for teaching purposes, as is the case at the Manchester Institute for Popular Culture at Manchester Metropolitan University, which maintains a large football fanzine archive built up with donated material (Haynes, 1995).

**Teams in the grey literature league: characteristics of grey literature**

**Grey literature: definitions**

It is an interesting co-incidence that the term “grey literature” acquired general currency in the library community at about the same time that fanzine publishing took off in Britain (Auger, 1989). However, the type of publications to which the term refers have been described by other means over their longer history (from the early 1900s or the 1940s according to Marsh (1992) and Auger (1989) respectively). Schmidmaier (1986) provides an interesting quotation from the 1920s:

“no librarian who takes his job seriously can today deny that careful attention has also to be paid to the ‘little literature’ and the numerous publications not available in normal book shops”.

In terms of production grey literature publications are non-professionally laid out and formatted (Auger, 1989), and rapidly published (Carroll, 1994). They contain material which is non-conventional (Marsh, 1992) and not subject to public peer review (Carroll, 1994). There is poor bibliographic information on these publications, making them difficult to identify and obtain through the usual channels (Auger, 1989).

**Grey literature: sample publications**

Many types of publication may be categorised as grey literature. Auger (1989) identifies “reports, technical notes and specifications, conference proceedings and pre-prints, translations, official publications, supplementary publications and data and trade literature.” To this list might be added newsletters for specific communities, theses and dissertations (Marsh, 1992). The new generation of electronic sources accessible over the Internet spawns a further set of “publications” exhibiting the features related to production, content, distribution and accessibility as outlined above (Carroll, 1994). As far as fanzines are concerned, these have been identified more specifically in the literature as sharing the characteristics of other grey
literature publications by authors such as Roberts (1978) and Johnson (1986).

The "invisible grey" strip: grey literature and bibliographic control

Bibliographic control

Bibliographic control refers to the "development and maintenance of a system of adequate recording of all forms of material... which add to the sum of human knowledge and information" (Davinson, 1982). Auger (1989), amongst others, observes that "grey literature has always been criticised for the complete absence or inconsistent application of any means of bibliographic control". Improvements in the quality of information provided by the publishers of grey literature would make tracing and accessing the sources easier (Knowles, 1981). The inaccessibility of collections through poor or non-existent bibliographic records render huge collections of information sources useless.

Bibliographic control and fanzines: case studies

There exist published case studies on the application of the principles of bibliographic control to fanzine collections. The cataloguing and recording of alternative press materials at the University of Connecticut is hindered by a lack of publishing information (Cross, 1989). Marseilles Public Library staff encountered acquisition problems in building up their special collection of comic books and fanzines and were forced to develop complementary acquisition and cataloguing techniques (Faur, 1982).

Bibliographic control and football fanzines: lists

Redhead (1987) points to the football fanzine archive at Manchester Metropolitan University (then Manchester Polytechnic). The catalogue for this private collection can be considered as a tool of bibliographic control. Every Tom, Dick and Harry provides an alphabetical listing of football fanzines and allocates them into one of five publishing categories: (1) seen regularly; (2) known to be still in existence, but not seen lately; (3) suspected defunct; (4) defunct; (5) rumoured to have once existed. The general football fanzines such as When Saturday Comes, Off the Ball and The Absolute Game provide listings. More general interest magazines, such as 442, review fanzine publications.

[A Football Compendium, compiled by Peter J. Seddon, published by the British Library, 1995, includes a section on fanzines - Ed.]

1994/5 season enquiry: researching fanzines in the Lothians

The fixture: research project

A small scale investigation completed in 1995 examined the problems associated with tracing and managing fanzine titles. The main aims of the project were to discover (a) how football fanzines could be identified, located, acquired and maintained; (b) the role football fanzines may play as a formal information source and (c) whether more could be said of the history of football fanzines. Data was collected through
The public library staff interviewed explained that they often have to add date and issue information to publications in the collection. The survey pertaining to the practices of the fanzine producers revealed that in some cases inconsistent volume and issue numbering and deliberately vague contact information resulted from the fanzine writers' desire to remain anonymous. If their opinions oppose those of the club in question then they may not want to be contactable. To compensate for this the librarians and fanzine collectors have developed non-standard procedures for acquiring material. For example, the public library has built up a special relationship with a shop that receives copies of football fanzines for sale and there is co-operation between libraries on collection development. Fanzine producers pointed out that in addition to the outlets identified in the literature their work could be bought from local newsagents, record shops and by subscription. The library staff and fanzine collectors use secondary sources to overcome access problems, such as lists published in When Saturday Comes and The Absolute Game and reviews in other fanzines, newspapers and magazines. Factsheet 5, produced in the States, is used by some fanzine collectors for the various fanzine types. Ironically, the legal requirement of copyright deposit, whereby the National Library of Scotland should receive automatically free copies of any fanzine distributed publicly to more than 50 people, fails in this context. A claims letter quoting the terms of Section 15 of the 1911 Copyright Act and sent to the editor of The Absolute Game met the following response in publication on the letters page: “Nice try pal, but you’ll just have to cough up the readies like everyone else.”

The team's performance: fanzines as formal information sources

All respondents to the survey felt strongly that fanzines should be treated as formal information sources. This was for a variety of reasons, some of which are quite specific. For example, the National Library of Scotland is bound to collect material that represents Scottish culture. Since football plays a large part in this fanzines are important, and they fit in with the co-operation of a number of individuals.

The squad: sample

The sample consulted included staff from two libraries believed to be unique in operating active collection development policies for football fanzines: the City of Edinburgh Central Library and the National Library of Scotland. The eight football fanzine producers in the Lothians were approached, of which five agreed to take part in the study. They represent fanzines for both league and non-league clubs, as well as a general and nationally distributed title. A number of fanzine experts and collectors from the UK also contributed to the survey.

Final score: results

Selecting the team: identification, location, acquisition and maintenance of fanzines

A lack of bibliographic information provided on fanzine publications contributes to the difficulties that librarians and fanzine collectors experience in tracing titles and managing issues.

The library staff and fanzine collectors use secondary sources to overcome access problems, such as lists published in When Saturday Comes and The Absolute Game and reviews in other fanzines, newspapers and magazines. Factsheet 5, produced in the States, is used by some fanzine collectors for the various fanzine types. Ironically, the legal requirement of copyright deposit, whereby the National Library of Scotland should receive automatically free copies of any fanzine distributed publicly to more than 50 people, fails in this context. A claims letter quoting the terms of Section 15 of the 1911 Copyright Act and sent to the editor of The Absolute Game met the following response in publication on the letters page: “Nice try pal, but you'll just have to cough up the readies like everyone else.”

The team's performance: fanzines as formal information sources

All respondents to the survey felt strongly that fanzines should be treated as formal information sources. This was for a variety of reasons, some of which are quite specific. For example, the National Library of Scotland is bound to collect material that represents Scottish culture. Since football plays a large part in these fanzines are important, and they fit in optimally...
well with other archives held by the Library, such as those of the Scottish Football association. The fanzine writers held the view that work of high quality, no matter the status of the journal in which it appears, was worth considering seriously. Library staff and experts commented on the uniqueness of material held within the photocopied pages: where else can information written by and for fans on the most topical issues be found? That fanzine material is quoted in books on football, has influenced mainstream sports reporting and contributed to changes in the presentation of football comment in other media such as television (eg: Fantasy football league) shows the broad acceptance of the information format, argued writers and collectors alike. Library staff were more cautious on the format's acceptance, highlighting their continued practice of considering fanzine publications as grey literature and referring to the unprofessionally produced, and sometimes deliberately offensive, material that makes its way into their collections.

The team's past: further information on fanzine history

In the course of the study further information on the history of fanzines emerged. One expert suggested that fanzines may date back as far as the seventeenth century if pamphlets reporting scandal, feuds and gossip could be counted as such. Meadowbank Review was identified as the first football fanzine in Scotland. Fans of small and non-league teams appreciate their fanzines as the only place to read about their club.

Post-match analysis: conclusions

This research project demonstrated that few pointers to the artefacts of football consumption, such as fanzines, makes it difficult for serious supporters and researchers to draw on a wealth of information. Since fanzine titles appear, disappear, resurface, change name, share editors, point to imaginary authorship and replicate club coverage it is not surprising that there are claims of a loss of important primary source material by those who try to track them. Yet this is part of the appeal of print fanzines both to the writers, who regard themselves as alternative, underground reporters, and to collectors as archivists of the unusual: the "elusiveness of fanzines ends up being their seductiveness for the die-hard collectors" (Haynes, 1995). Joining the writers and collectors are those who enjoy fanzines as a print extension of the oral traditions of football.

It might be argued that in a time when supporters are suffering from the commercial glare of media-saturated sponsorship, along with stories of corruption, amateur fanzines offer welcome grey shade. Grey literature in (or on) the football field contributes to an intellectual heritage and efforts towards improved bibliographic control, taking into account the difficulties described, serve to render the shades more distinct.

Fig.3: Potters Monthly: a fanzine with full credentials: ISSN, issue number and date
On the bench: acknowledgements

This work is based on a dissertation completed for a BA (Hons) Information Management degree completed in 1995. Neil Smith would like to acknowledge all those who agreed to be interviewed and respond to his questionnaires. He notes special thanks to Peter Wellburn and Tony Jones. The field work research was supported by the 1995 John Campbell Trust Award offered by the Institute of Information Scientists.

Hazel Hall is grateful to Martin Higgins and Ben Shaw for comments on the first draft of the paper, and Ian Somerville for the loan of his precious Newcastle United kit. Special thanks are due to top scorer Tim Read and super-sub Shaun Moores.

References

1. Manchester United adopted a grey away strip in the 1995/6 season. After a 3-1 defeat at Southampton on 13th April 1996 the strip was withdrawn on the grounds that it made players invisible.


Faur, J.C., The centre for the study and documentation of images at Marseilles municipal library, Public Library February pp 85-88, 1982.


Lacey, M., El Tel was a space alien: the best of football fanzines volume 1 Sheffield: Juna.


Schmidmaier, D., Ask no questions and you’ll be told no lies: or how we can remove people’s fears of grey literature, LIBRI Vol.36, no.2, pp 98-112, 1986.

